

# Final Report and Adoption of Strategic Recommendations

---

Linda Lee and Rick Leong,  
Co-Moderators

Truth Commission Assessing Race  
Equity (T-CARE)

February 2025  
San Francisco Presbytery



# Overview of Today's Presentation

---

- Background
- Audit Process
- Themes and Patterns
- Conversation Circles
- Strategic Recommendations
- Motion for Adoption
- Thank you!





# Background

---

- Commissioning, November 15, 2022
- Training
- Formation



# Audit Process

---



**Crossroads Antiracism Organizing & Training**

Dismantling Racism, Building Racial Justice in Institutions

- Continuum
- Matrix
- Survey
- Case Studies

## Section 3: Continuum on Becoming An Antiracist Institution (Expanded Edition)

<b>WHITE CULTURE</b>	→ → → → →	<b>MULTIRACIAL</b>	→ → → → →	<b>ANTIRACIST</b>	→ → → → →	<b>ANTIRACIST</b>
<b>CULTURE</b>						
Differences Seen as Deficits & Threats		Tolerant of but Invested in Controlling Differences		Differences Seen as Assets		Differences Are Celebrated & Experienced as Strengths

<b>1. EXCLUSIVE Institution</b>	<b>2. CLUB Institution</b>	<b>3. SYMBOLIC Institution</b>	<b>4. CRITICALLY CONSCIOUS Institution</b>	<b>5. ANTIRACIST Institution</b>	<b>6. LIBERATORY Institution</b>
---------------------------------	----------------------------	--------------------------------	--	----------------------------------	----------------------------------

# Themes and Patterns

---

Insiders and Outsiders

---

Control of Decision-making

---

Rigidity

---

Accountability gap between our vision/goals

---

Scarcity in Stewardship

---

Conflict Avoidance



# Conversation Circles



## Strategic Recommendations

We recognize a tendency in the Presbytery to read this report and call it complete. We must not do this. The work of antiracism requires that this be not an ending but a beginning. We envision further analysis, with deep listening, heartfelt confession, and the making of concrete amends toward a more equitable and faithful future.

# Strategic Recommendations

---

1. Hire a Race Equity Manager and Establish a Reparations and Community Healing Commission
2. Committee Work
3. Truth and Reconciliation
4. Living History





# Strategic Recommendation #1

## Establish a Reparations and Community Healing Commission

- The Reparations and Community Healing Commission will take this T-CARE report and guide the implementation of our recommendations. They will work toward a more inclusive and equitable community where there is a sense of belonging and empowerment for all members of the Presbytery. This Commission will have dedicated staff leadership and support through a [Race Equity Manager](#). They will take concrete steps to heal the wounds of white supremacy and reallocate resources (not just money, but staff and other kinds of attention) in more equitable ways, working toward the reality of our Matthew 25 commitments.
- See pages 12-13 (English), 14-15 (Spanish), 11-12 (Chinese), 15-16 (Korean)

# Strategic Recommendation #2

## **Committee Work (focused on the structures of our presbytery)**

- Beginning in 2025, the Reparations and Community Healing Commission shall engage all committees, commissions, and standing working groups (henceforth “groups”) of our presbytery to integrate the work of racial equity into all we do as a presbytery structure.
- Capacity building: engage skilled facilitation in order to increase the capacity of groups to discuss race equity issues, building trust, awareness, and skills. Each group to meet at minimum twice a year with the provided facilitators to focus on one or more of our identified themes and how it affects their work.
- Engage backup support such as chaplains, spiritual directors, or facilitators skilled in restorative justice which may be called on for groups or individuals in presbytery leadership when conflict situations require more attention
- See pages 14 – 15 (English), 15-16 (Spanish), 12-13 (Chinese), 16 – 17 (Korean)

# Strategic Recommendation #3

## **Truth and Reconciliation Process: 2026-2027 (focused on the structures of the Presbytery)**

- Trauma has been experienced within the Presbytery, and it remains with us, still in need of healing. Yet many do not know about these painful experiences; we have many people responding “I don’t know” to questions about the harms experienced in the Presbytery. We need to hear, accept, and acknowledge the pain that the Presbytery, its BIPOC leaders, and its communities have endured. This is the only way to healing. This process will also guide us toward taking reparative action.
- See page 15 (English), 17 (Spanish), 13 (Chinese), 17-18 (Korean)



# Strategic Recommendation #4

## **Living History: completion in 2028 (focused on the worshiping communities and the communities we live in)**

- Convene a group to tell a more truthful history of the racial history of the Bay Area through the lens of our presbytery's experience, that we might better understand the context in which we seek to serve. Surface the untold stories of the past – those concealed stories and resistance stories – that we might better understand the context in which we seek to serve our local communities. Uncovering stories of racialized harm with compassion and attention to the process of healing from generational trauma. Hearing stories of resistance to celebrate those who worked for justice and equity, and to inspire future resistance. Publish our findings in appropriate ways (written, video, media) to share with others.
- See Pages 15 and 16 (English), 17-18 (Spanish), 13-14 (Chinese), 18 (Korean)

# Motion for Adoption

---

The Truth Commission Assessing Race Equity (T-CARE) requests that the Presbytery of San Francisco receive with appreciation to all who contributed to this work, approve, and acknowledge the truths shared in the “*Race Equity Audit - Final Report*” and commit to the implementation of all the Strategic Recommendations as detailed in the report, including

---

a. The hiring of the Race Equity Manager staff position approved in the 2025 Presbytery budget to provide leadership in this work. The Transitional Executive Presbyter will manage the hiring process for the position of Race Equity Manager and,

---

b. The establishment of the Reparations and Community Healing Commission who will guide the implementation of the recommended committee work, Truth and Reconciliation process, and Living History.



# Thank you!

Mustapha Baksh	Rev. Kamal Hassan	Marda Quon Stothers	Lori Yamauchi
Rev. Barbara Barkley	Noah Kruis	Jeanne Choy Tate	Rev. Daeseop Yee
Marge Campany	Elaine Liang	Rev. Karen Thistlethwaite	Rev. Jinwook Yang
Caneisha Felder	Rev. Enicia Montalvo	Whittney Tom	
Rev. Paul Gaffney	Rev. Pablo Morataya	Jessica Vasquez Torres	
Angelina Garcia	Rochelle Shaw	Rev. Ruth T. West	
Clementina Chacon-Garcia	Grace So	Leticia Williams	

Prayer held us together and guided our journey. Without the Holy Spirit present among us, we could not have completed this challenging work. Thanks be to God.



# Vision for the Future

---

- A presbytery with full participation and effective representation in all decisions.
- A presbytery that understands its history and the context in which we live.
- A presbytery that has named and healed from past harms.
- A spiritual community where people feel they belong.







Strategic Recommendations

Full Text



## **1. Establish a Reparations and Community Healing Commission**

The Reparations and Community Healing Commission will take this T-CARE report and guide the implementation of our recommendations. They will work toward a more inclusive and equitable community where there is a sense of belonging and empowerment for all members of the Presbytery. This Commission will have dedicated staff leadership and support through a [Race Equity Manager](#). They will take concrete steps to heal the wounds of white supremacy and reallocate resources (not just money, but staff and other kinds of attention) in more equitable ways, working toward the reality of our Matthew 25 commitments. They will:

1. Report directly to the Presbytery.
2. Regularly communicate with MVL and the executive staff.
3. Additionally, hold special accountability to BIPOC members of the presbytery.

Note: The presbytery does not currently have an established and regularly meeting body of accountability such as a “black caucus” or “pastors of color” group but would prioritize and welcome their wisdom, feedback, and accountability.

4. Include executive, leadership, and staff support.

Recommendation 1  
continued

5. Be comprised of 12-15 people:
  - i. Willing to serve a three-year term, with the recognition some will need to rotate off and new people will rotate on,
  - ii. Representing the full diversity of our presbytery, with a demonstrated commitment to the work of racial justice,
  - iii. With references who can speak to that commitment to racial justice,
  - iv. Having experience with Presbytery and/or its worshiping communities,
  - v. \*note: we hope to provide the moderators with a list of people willing to be on this commission, and those who are willing to be added later if a member should need to drop out early.
6. **Spring and summer 2025:** go through training with the Othering & Belonging Institute (OBI) and familiarize themselves with T-CARE's work including the most relevant Crossroads training modules.
7. **2025-2028:** Hold accountability (either directly or through delegation, contracting, hiring etc.) for the implementation of the below interventions: 2 Committee Work, 3. Truth and Reconciliation Process, and 4. Living History
  - i. Work with staff to review an annual budget,
  - ii. Work with Personnel to ensure that staff including executive-level staff have sufficient time allotted and protected for this work,
  - iii. Regularly update Presbytery on these interventions and their implementation.
8. **In 2028:** create a scope of work for the next three years (whether assigned to a continuance of this commission or assigned to various other accountable entities) and make recommendations directly to Presbytery for further engagement of the work of healing, reparations, and equity.

## 2. Committee Work (focused on the structures of our presbytery)

Beginning in 2025, the Reparations and Community Healing Commission shall engage all committees, commissions, and standing working groups (henceforth “groups”) of our presbytery to integrate the work of racial equity into all we do as a presbytery structure.

1. Capacity building: engage skilled facilitation in order to increase the capacity of groups to discuss race equity issues, building trust, awareness, and skills. Each group to meet at minimum twice a year with the provided facilitators to focus on one or more of our identified themes and how it affects their work.
2. Engage backup support such as chaplains, spiritual directors, or facilitators skilled in restorative justice which may be called on for groups or individuals in presbytery leadership when conflict situations require more attention.
3. Serve as a resource to groups dealing with key concerns, **for example:**
  - i. Partner with MVL (Mission, Vision and Leadership) to engage in visioning exercises toward a more compelling sense of mission and vision,
  - ii. Partner with Meetings Working Group and presbytery staff to assess and address what makes it so hard to understand how to do business in the Presbytery,
  - iii. Partner with the West Region Antiracism Group to explore expanding and funding their work in the Presbytery,

## Recommendation 2

### Continued

- iv. Partner with FPOC to address the lack of consensus that our presbytery's funds are available for use when needed,
  - v. Work with FPOC to establish ongoing commitments to pay reparative land tax to the native peoples of this land (Ohlone and Ramaytush); make these payments starting in 2025 and going forward; encourage all congregations to participate in these land taxes,
  - vi. Partner with NOM-COR to strengthen their transition to CORBE (Committee on Representation and Belonging) and address disparities in a felt sense of belonging,
  - vii. Partner with the New Worshipping Community (NWC) Working Group to ensure they have strong staff support and volunteer members. Pursue pathways for NWCs to gain equal standing within the Presbytery, including the right to vote at Presbytery meetings.
4. Partner with any and all groups creating a culture change from task-oriented identities toward a community of being and belonging, for example any of the following:
- i. Working on community building and relationship strengthening through storytelling,
  - ii. Developing spiritual practices such as "respectful communications" (from Kaleidoscope Institute, Appendix 5) or the "courageous agreements" T-CARE developed (see appendix 4), which center the work of anti-racism and keep it spiritually grounded,
  - iii. Developing agreements and accountability measures,
  - iv. Working in affinity groups by racial identification (at minimum, a group for white people and a group for BIPOC, in some cases subdivided into smaller groups).



### 3. Truth and Reconciliation Process: 2026-2027 (focused on the structures of the Presbytery)

Trauma has been experienced within the Presbytery, and it remains with us, still in need of healing. Yet many do not know about these painful experiences; we have many people responding “I don’t know” to questions about the harms experienced in the Presbytery. We need to hear, accept, and acknowledge the pain that the Presbytery, its BIPOC leaders, and its communities have endured. This is the only way to healing. This process will also guide us toward taking reparative action.

1. Begin with acknowledgment of the stories of racist harm we have identified, such as the story of Hillside Church’s closure (analysis in appendix 6)
2. Articulate the impact to people of color, the advantage created for white people, and the ways in which the Presbytery’s culture, norms, and structural processes perpetuated the impact and the benefit.
3. Set a tone of confession lament, and grief for known harms.
4. Express clearly that there are many more harms not publicly known, and even when the harms are known there are still hidden pieces of the story; express clearly that we are seeking to hear more.
5. Hold several open sessions at significant locations with skilled facilitation where all presbyters and congregation members are invited to listen and to speak. The purpose of these sessions is to gather, surface and acknowledge and grieve the stories of harm, listen deeply to the impact it has had on those who were harmed, grapple with the reality of racism, and suggest appropriate amends.

<https://www.pcusa.org/resource/report-scrtr-ga225/>

#### **4. Living History: completion in 2028 (focused on the worshiping communities and the communities we live in)**

1. Convene a group to tell a more truthful history of the racial history of the Bay Area through the lens of our presbytery's experience, that we might better understand the context in which we seek to serve. Surface the untold stories of the past – those concealed stories and resistance stories – that we might better understand the context in which we seek to serve our local communities. Uncovering stories of racialized harm with compassion and attention to the process of healing from generational trauma. Hearing stories of resistance to celebrate those who worked for justice and equity, and to inspire future resistance. Publish our findings in appropriate ways (written, video, media) to share with others.
2. Consult with the BIPOC communities of our presbytery and its worshiping communities, as well as with the local community.
3. Consult with first-hand witnesses and second-hand history keepers.

## Recommendation 4

### Continued

4. Consider highlighting important historical contours such as
  - Violence of the white settlers' arrival and displacement of Native American peoples,
  - Waves of immigration and forms of discrimination,
  - The Chinese Exclusion Act,
  - Redlining (housing segregation),
  - The internment of Japanese people,
  - More recent waves of immigration and arrival of refugee populations,
  - Gentrification and recent economic pressures,
  - Resistance and demonstration against hate groups – organized stands against anti-muslim, anti-semitic, anti-asian and other hate groups.
5. Consider a “Living History” pilgrimage or a series of walking tours, as well as written or filmed materials.
6. With the result that in the summer or fall of 2028 we can engage in dedicated days/weekends of history education together, hearing from our own members and from those who carry other aspects of local history through experience or study, to better understand the context in which we seek to serve.