

Summary of Race Equity Survey

Truth Commission Assessing Race Equity (T-CARE)

Sylvia Chatagnier, Linda Lee, Rev. Evangeline Pua, and Linda Spencer
October 3, 2024

On May 21, 2024, the Truth Commission Assessing Race Equity (T-CARE) released an anonymous Google Forms survey to the presbytery membership. The survey included questions related to key concerns identified by T-CARE and basic demographic information. The survey was available in English, Korean, Indonesian, Spanish, and Traditional Chinese.

Members of the presbytery were notified of the survey through:

- An open space workshop and docketed agenda item presentation during May 21, 2024, presbytery meeting (on-line and paper versions of the survey)
- Individual emails sent to 334 presbytery members who are:
 - Session members identified by their Session clerks in an earlier T-CARE survey
 - Session clerks
 - Congregational pastors
 - Presbytery committee chairs
 - New Worshipping Community pastors
 - Attendees of presbytery trainings on antiracism
- Email blast to the 900+ subscribers of the presbytery newsletter
- Email blast to all subscribers of the West Region Antiracism Group newsletter

The survey closed on July 1st, 2024. We received 261 responses. The survey form includes a timestamp with the date and time the survey was completed. The date of responses suggests that the highest response rates followed the presbytery meeting, the West Region Antiracism Group email, and the email blast to presbytery newsletter mailing list.

To prepare the data for analysis, the non-English survey data was translated into English. Paper copies of the survey were manually entered into Google forms. Within Excel, the data was transformed into formats usable for Pivot Table analysis. The survey language was added as a new column.

We include a summary of all responses organized first by demographics, then by “key concerns”. For ease of reading, we grouped together agree with strongly agree and disagree with strongly disagree. To probe the results more deeply, we used a tool within Excel called a “pivot” table. This enabled us to query the demographics of those who agreed, disagreed, or didn’t know for any given survey question.

Some Highlights:

- 261 responses representing a cross-section of the presbytery
 - 45% identified as a person of color (BIPOC)
 - 55% have served the presbytery in some capacity
- T-CARE's survey amplifies voices of BIPOC members of the presbytery because they responded in larger proportions than their population within the presbytery.
 - 33% are estimated to be a person of color within the presbytery
- T-CARE's survey had a small sample of members of the presbytery (8% of the total) who took the survey in another language (Korean, Spanish, and Traditional Chinese). Likely non-English speakers are underrepresented in the survey.
- Over half of respondents agreed that:
 - They are comfortable participating in presbytery meetings (66%)
 - They feel welcome to participate and make their contribution to the presbytery (58%)
 - They feel at ease to participate and make their contribution (58%)
 - They are confident their worshipping community could receive help when needed (66%)
- Over half of respondents didn't know
 - If churches/clergy of color have experienced racist actions within our presbytery resulting in trauma and mistrust (53%)
 - If people are expected to "move on" without support after racial conflict has occurred (61%)
 - If the presbytery prioritizes long-term financial stability over present ministry needs (51%)
- Nearly half agreed that
 - It is hard to know how to do business in the presbytery (47%)
 - I am heard and my voice matters (47%)
- Nearly half disagreed that
 - They have seen harm or they, themselves, have been harmed during a conflict with the presbytery (47%)
- Nearly half didn't know
 - If presbytery has a clear vision for dismantling structural racism (49%)
 - If there is enough discussion at presbytery meetings to understand all sides of an issue before voting (47%)

Survey Demographic Results

Sixty five percent of the respondents identified as either a ruling or teaching elder. Another 21% listed their primary identity as a member of a congregation or a new worshipping community. Eight percent identified as commissioned ruling elder/lay pastors, while 3% are candidates for ordination. The 3% shown as “other” below include several roles that are small. This includes presbytery staff, deacons, clerks of session, or staff at a congregation. Twenty-seven people identified themselves as voting commissioner to the presbytery, in addition to other roles (e.g., ruling elder).

Roles	Percent
Ruling Elder	43%
Teaching Elder	22%
CRE	8%
Member of Congregation	21%
Candidate for Ordination	3%
Other	3%
Total	100%

Over 50% of the respondents have served in the presbytery in some capacity.

Presbytery service	Percent	Count
Served in the presbytery	55%	143
Have not served in the presbytery	45%	118
Total	100%	261

Respondents who have served, did so on a committee, a working group/task force, an administrative commission, or worked as staff. In addition, they have chaired, co-chaired, or moderated committees, commissions, or working group/task forces.

Role	Respondents
Committee chairs	65
Member of Task Force/Working Group	111
Member of Committee	81
Member of Administrative Commission	23

Many respondents have served in multiple capacities.

Number of Roles	Number of Respondents
Served in one role	61
Served in two roles	27
Served in three roles	33
Served in four or more roles	22

Over 75 percent of responses came from those who are 56 and over; one person identified as under 25.

Age Range	Percent
25 and under	0.4%
26 to 40	7.0%
41 to 55	13.6%
56 to 70	40.5%
70 and over	38.5%
Total	100%

Over half the responses identify as females. No one identified as transgender, non-binary, or another gender.

Gender Identity	Percent	Count
Female	55.6%	145
Male	44.0%	115
Prefer not to state	0.4%	1
Total	100%	261

Respondents gave 20 unique identities in response to the question on racial identity. There was a preference to state what the different racial identities were versus selecting Multi-racial. To protect the anonymity of the one respondent who identifies as Middle Eastern/North African, they were added to the Multi-racial group.¹ To simplify the analysis, responses were grouped into the six categories shown on the next table. The survey received responses from 45% persons of color and 54% white persons, with the remainder preferring not to state.

¹ <https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2024/02/25/us/census-race-ethnicity-middle-east-north-africa.html>

Racial Identity	Count	% in Survey	Est. % in PSF
Asian/Pacific Islander/South Asian	61	23%	19%
Black/African American/African	22	8%	4%
Hispanic/Latinx	22	8%	6%
Multi-racial	13	5%	3.4%
BIPOC Subtotal	118	45%	33%
White	141	54%	67%
Prefer not to state	2	1%	0%
Grand Total	261	100%	100%

To put these numbers in perspective, we compared them to the racial/ethnic makeup of our presbytery. The 2022 statistical report is the most comprehensive available information. The 2023 data still has some errors according to our Stated Clerk. In 2022 just over half (58%) of churches reported their racial/ethnic information. To estimate the racial/ethnic population of the remaining churches, estimates of the population were made from the 2021 Clerk’s report, “Racial/Ethnic and Multi-Cultural Congregations as of 2021”. T-CARE's survey amplifies voices of BIPOC members of the presbytery because they responded in larger proportions than their population within the presbytery. In 2022 the Holy Cow survey received 186 responses, of which 82% percent came from white respondents.

The survey was available in five languages. All but the Indonesian translation was accessed by respondents.

Survey Language	Count
English	238
Korean	6
Spanish	16
Traditional Chinese	1
Total	261

Over 8% of responses came from those who don’t identify as straight. Five percent preferred not to state their sexual orientation.

Sexual orientation	Count	Percent
A different term	5	2%
Bisexual	7	3%
Don't know	2	1%
Gay or lesbian	8	3%
Prefer not to answer	13	5%

Straight	226	87%
Total	261	100%

The racial/ethnic identity of the congregations of those taking the survey was 50% BIPOC and 50% white.

Worshipping Community Identity	Percent
Asian/Pacific Islander/South Asian	20%
Black/African American/African	7%
Hispanic/Latinx	5%
Immigrant	2%
Multi-Racial	18%
BIPOC Subtotal	50%
White	50%
Total	100%

The responses were distributed between the presbytery's three regions. Other/NA refers to people who don't identify with a worshipping community, or who attend outside of the presbytery. Nine respondents indicated that they didn't know the presbytery had regions.

Region	Responses
Central	75
East	80
West	86
Other/NA	20
Total	261

Responses reflected a cross-section of worshipping community size. The smallest (under 40) and largest (over 500) responded in lower numbers than mid-sized worshipping communities.

Worshipping Community Size	Percent
Under 40	18%
41 to 99	32%
100 - 500	35%
Over 500	13%
Not applicable	3%
Total	100%

Key Concerns

Key concerns are the behaviors of the presbytery that T-CARE believes are underlying and sustaining systemic racism. The key concerns were identified during our work with Crossroads' Continuum Tool and the Matrix Tool. T-CARE Race Equity Survey was designed to gather information that will guide our interventions

Below are the responses to T-CARE's key concerns:

1. Insiders/outsideers,
2. Control of decision making,
3. Rigidity,
4. Accountability gap regarding our vision/goals,
5. Scarcity in stewardship, and
6. Conflict avoidance.

1. Insiders/Outsiders. Survey Questions 10, 22, 26

Nearly half of respondents agreed that their voice matters to the presbytery.

10. I am heard, and my voice matters to the presbytery	Percent
Agree	47%
Disagree	15%
Don't know	38%
Total	100%

Multi-racial respondents were more likely to disagree than other racial groups. White people and Asian respondents were more likely to respond that they didn't know.

10. I am heard and my voice matters to the presbytery	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Total
Asian/Pacific Islander/South Asian	34%	21%	44%	100%
Black/African American/African	64%	14%	23%	100%
Hispanic/Latinx	59%	9%	32%	100%
Multi-racial	38%	38%	23%	100%
White	48%	11%	40%	100%

Looking at other demographic data for those that disagreed, gender and experience with the presbytery (as measured by the number of different roles served) were not factors. However,

those in the East and West Regions were more likely to disagree, compared to the to the Central Region.

10. I am heard, and my voice matters to the presbytery	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Total
Central	55%	7%	39%	100%
East	41%	15%	44%	100%
West	45%	21%	34%	100%

Most respondents indicated that they feel at ease in the presbytery.

22. I feel at ease in the presbytery	Percent
Agree	56%
Disagree	21%
Don't know	24%
Total	100%

Of the 21% that disagreed, they are more likely to be within the group we identified as multi-racial.

22. I feel at ease in the presbytery	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Total
Asian/Pacific Islander/South Asian	51%	30%	20%	100%
Black/African American/African	41%	32%	27%	100%
Hispanic/Latinx	64%	9%	27%	100%
Multi-racial	46%	38%	15%	100%
White	60%	15%	25%	100%

Just over 40% of respondents disagreed that the presbytery has made decisions that negatively impacted their worshipping community.

26. The presbytery has made decisions that have negatively impact my worshipping community	Percent
Agree	20%
Disagree	41%
Don't know	30%
Not applicable	10%
Total	100%

We looked a little more deeply at the 20% of respondents that agreed that the presbytery has made decisions that negatively impacted their worshipping community. Black/African American/African (41%) and Multi-racial (50%) respondents are more likely to agree with this statement. This is in sharp contrast to white respondents (14%).

26. The presbytery has made decisions that have negatively impact my worshipping community	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	N/A	Total
Asian/Pacific Islander/South Asian	20%	30%	33%	18%	100%
Black/African American/African	41%	27%	18%	14%	100%
Hispanic/Latinx	23%	36%	41%	0%	100%
Multi-racial	50%	8%	33%	8%	100%
White	14%	50%	28%	8%	100%

2. Control of Decision Making. Survey Questions 8, 15, 20

Nearly half of respondents agreed that it is hard to do business in the presbytery.

8. It is hard to understand how to do business in the presbytery.	Percent
Agree	47%
Disagree	28%
Don't know	26%
Total	100%

For respondents who took the survey in other languages, the agreement is strong.

8. It is hard to understand how to do business in the presbytery.	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Total
Survey Language				
Korean	83%	0%	17%	100%
Spanish	63%	13%	25%	100%
Traditional Chinese	0%	0%	100%	100%

There is an even stronger agreement from those attending immigrant churches.

(8) It is hard to understand how to do business in the presbytery.	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Total
Asian/Pacific Islander/South Asian	45%	33%	22%	100%
Black/African American/African	65%	24%	12%	100%
Hispanic/Latinx	50%	17%	33%	100%
Immigrant	80%	20%	0%	100%

Multi-Racial	46%	37%	17%	100%
White	47%	24%	32%	100%

Teaching Elders agreed in greater percentages compared to Ruling Elders.

8. It is hard to understand how to do business in the presbytery.	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Total
Commissioned ruling elder (lay pastor)	42%	50%	8%	100%
Member of a congregation or a New Worshipping Community	36%	21%	43%	100%
Ruling elder	44%	28%	28%	100%
Teaching elder	59%	33%	8%	100%
Grand Total	46%	28%	26%	100%

Opinions were divided on whether there is enough discussion at presbytery meetings to understand all sides of an issue before voting. Nearly half of respondents did not know.

15. There is not enough discussion at presbytery meetings to understand all sides of an issue before voting	Percent
Agree	27%
Disagree	26%
Don't know	47%
Total	100%

For those that responded that they didn't know, over two-thirds have not served within the presbytery.

15. There is not enough discussion at presbytery meetings to understand all sides before voting.	Don't Know
Service in presbytery	
None	68%
Served in 1 role	16%
Served in 2 roles	11%
Served in 3 roles	4%
Served in 4 roles	2%
Served in five roles	0%
Total	100%

Only 34% of respondents agreed that the presbytery makes decision to help all congregations/NWC's thrive.

20. The presbytery makes decisions to help all congregations/NWC's thrive	Percent
Agree	34%
Disagree	22%
Don't know	44%
Total	100%

White respondents were more likely than BIPOC respondents to not know.

20. The presbytery makes decisions to help all congregations/NWC's thrive	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Total
BIPOC	38%	27%	35%	100%
WHITE	30%	18%	52%	100%

3. Key Concern: Rigidity. Survey questions 7, 13, and 14.

Two-thirds of respondents feel comfortable participating in presbytery meetings.

7. I feel comfortable participating in presbytery meetings	Percent
Agree	66%
Disagree	13%
Don't know	21%
Total	100%

Most respondents did not know if the presbytery inspires creativity in its work.

13. The presbytery inspires creativity in its work	Percent
Agree	29%
Disagree	28%
Don't know	43%
Total	100%

White respondents were more likely to disagree or not know when compared to BIPOC respondents.

13. The presbytery inspires creativity in its work.	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Total
BIPOC	32%	36%	31%	100%
White	27%	20%	53%	100%

Well over half of respondents feel welcome to participate and make their contribution to the presbytery.

14. I feel welcome to participate and to make my contribution to the presbytery	Percent
Agree	58%
Disagree	17%
Don't know	25%
Total	100%

However, only 20% of those from immigrant worshipping communities agreed.

14.I feel welcome to participate and to make my contribution to the presbytery	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Total
Asian/Pacific Islander/South Asian	47%	14%	39%	100%
Black/African American/African	71%	18%	12%	100%
Hispanic/Latinx	67%	25%	8%	100%
Immigrant	20%	40%	40%	100%
Multi-Racial	65%	17%	17%	100%
White	59%	16%	25%	100%

4. Key Concern: Accountability Gap Regarding Our Vision/Goals. Survey questions 11, 18, 23, 27.

Less than half of respondents agreed that the presbytery walks the talk.

11. The presbytery "walks the talk". Our actions are in alignment with our values	Percent
Agree	40%
Disagree	26%
Don't know	34%
Total	100%

We looked racial identity and see that 50% of Black/African American/African and 50% of Multi-racial respondents disagree. Only 18% of white respondents disagreed. White respondents were more likely than other racial groups to respond that they didn't know.

11. The presbytery "walks the talk". Our actions are in alignment with our values	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Total
Asian/Pacific Islander/South Asian	36%	33%	31%	100%
Black/African American/African	23%	50%	27%	100%
Hispanic/Latinx	64%	23%	14%	100%
Multi-racial	23%	46%	31%	100%
White	43%	18%	40%	100%

Only one-quarter of those surveyed agreed that the presbytery has a clear vision for dismantling structural racism.

18. The presbytery has a clear vision for dismantling structural racism	Percent
Agree	24%
Disagree	27%
Don't know	49%
Total	100%

White respondents were significantly most likely to respond that they didn't know. Only 14% of black respondents agreed with this statement, compared to 64% of Hispanic/Latinx.

18. The presbytery has a clear vision for dismantling structural racism	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Total
Asian/Pacific Islander/South Asian	23%	34%	43%	100%
Black/African American/African	14%	50%	36%	100%
Hispanic/Latinx	64%	14%	23%	100%
Multi-racial	15%	54%	31%	100%
White	21%	21%	58%	100%

Those who have served the presbytery in some capacity are more likely to disagree.

18. The presbytery has a clear vision for dismantling structural racism	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Total
No Role Served in PSF	20%	14%	65%	100%
One to Five Roles Served in PSF	27%	38%	35%	100%

Less than half of respondents agreed that the presbytery is holding itself accountable for taking actions to dismantle structural racism.

23. The presbytery is holding itself accountable for taking actions to dismantle structural racism		Percent
Agree		44%
Disagree		15%
Don't know		41%
Total		100%

Most of those surveyed did not know if the presbytery is making a difference in their communities.

27. The presbytery is making a difference in our local communities		Percent
Agree		38%
Disagree		20%
Don't Know		43%
Total		100%

Looking at worshipping community identity we did see a strong trend in Hispanic/Latinx worshipping communities agreeing.

This presbytery is making a difference in our local communities	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Total
Asian/Pacific Islander/South Asian	31%	24%	45%	100%
Black/African American/African	24%	35%	41%	100%
Hispanic/Latinx	75%	17%	8%	100%
Immigrant	40%	20%	40%	100%
Multi-Racial	50%	15%	35%	100%
White	34%	18%	48%	100%
Grand Total	38%	20%	43%	100%

Churches that are larger (>100) are more likely to disagree.

This presbytery is making a difference in our local communities	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Not applicable	Total
Under 40	37%	29%	27%	8%	100%
Under 100	22%	40%	26%	12%	100%

Under 500	14%	46%	27%	12%	100%
Over 500	9%	52%	39%	0%	100%

Key Concern: Scarcity in Stewardship. Survey questions 12, 19, 24.

There wasn't a difference between agree, disagree, and don't know for the statement, "the presbytery's resources are easily available when needed."

12. The presbytery's resources are easily available for use when needed	Percent
Agree	31%
Disagree	34%
Don't know	35%
Total	100%

Respondents from Immigrant and Hispanic/Latinx worshipping communities are significantly less likely to agree.

12. The presbytery's resources are easily available for use when needed	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Total
Worshipping Community				
Asian/Pacific Islander/South Asian	27%	37%	35%	100%
Black/African American/African	24%	47%	29%	100%
Hispanic/Latinx	17%	42%	42%	100%
Immigrant	20%	60%	20%	100%
Multi-Racial	43%	24%	33%	100%
White	31%	32%	37%	100%
Grand Total	31%	34%	35%	100%

The majority responded that they didn't know if the presbytery prioritizes long-term financial stability over present ministry needs. Those that did have an opinion were more likely to agree.

19. The presbytery prioritizes long-term financial stability over present ministry needs	Percent
Agree	32%
Disagree	16%
Don't know	51%
Total	100%

Additionally, 65% of Black/African American, African respondents agreed that the presbytery prioritizes long-term financial stability over present ministry needs.

19. The presbytery prioritizes long-term financial stability over present ministry needs	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Total
Asian/Pacific Islander/South Asian	29%	12%	59%	100%
Black/African American/African	65%	6%	29%	100%
Hispanic/Latinx	50%	33%	17%	100%
Immigrant	20%	60%	20%	100%
Multi-Racial	35%	15%	50%	100%
White	27%	17%	56%	100%

A large majority agreed that they are confident that their worshipping community would receive help from the presbytery when needed.

24. I am confident that my worshipping community would be able to receive help from the presbytery when needed	Percent
Agree	66%
Disagree	13%
Don't know	18%
Not applicable	3%
Total	100%

Of those that disagreed with this statement, they are more likely from a smaller church (less than 100).

24. I am confident that my worshipping community would be able to receive help from the presbytery when needed	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Not applicable	Total
Under 40	61%	22%	14%	2%	100%
Under 100	64%	15%	17%	4%	100%
Under 500	73%	9%	15%	3%	100%
Over 500	70%	6%	21%	3%	100%

Key Concern: Conflict avoidance. Survey Questions 9, 16, 21, 25.

36% of respondents agreed that they have been harmed or had seen harm during a conflict within the presbytery. This includes 33% of all white respondents and 38% of all BIPOC respondents.

9. I have seen harm or I, myself have been harmed during a conflict within the presbytery	Percent
Agree	36%
Disagree	47%
Don't know	17%
Total	100%

9. I have seen harm or I, myself have been harmed during a conflict within the presbytery	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Total
BIPOC	38%	42%	20%	100%
White	33%	52%	15%	100%

Nearly 40% of respondents agreed that churches/clergy of color have experienced racist actions within our presbytery resulting in trauma and mistrust.

16. Churches/clergy of color have experienced racist actions within our presbytery resulting in trauma and distrust	Percent
Agree	39%
Disagree	11%
Don't know	53%
Total	100%

No Black/African American/African respondents disagreed. 65% of white respondents “didn’t know.”

16. Churches/clergy of color have experienced racist actions within our presbytery resulting in trauma and distrust	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Total
Asian/Pacific Islander/South Asian	38%	21%	41%	100%
Black/African American/African	68%	0%	32%	100%
Hispanic/Latinx	55%	9%	36%	100%
Multi-racial	38%	23%	38%	100%
White	33%	3%	65%	100%

Over 60% of respondents did not know if people are expected to “move on” without support after racial conflict has occurred within our presbytery.

21. People are expected to "move on" without support after racial conflict has occurred within our presbytery	Percent
Agree	26%
Disagree	13%
Don't know	61%
Total	100%

74% of white respondents “did not know” compared to 41% of BIPOC respondents.

21. People are expected to "move on" without support after racial conflict has occurred within our presbytery	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Total
BIPOC	40%	19%	41%	100%
White	15%	11%	74%	100%

Overall, only 24% of respondents agreed presbytery steers clear of racially charged situations.

25. The presbytery steers clear of racially charged situations	Percent
Agree	24%
Disagree	30%
Don't know	46%
Total	100%

However, 53% of white respondents “did not know” if the presbytery steered clear of racially charged situations. In contrast, only 37% of BIPOC respondents “did not know”.

25. The presbytery steers clear of racially charged situations	Agree	Disagree	Don't Know	Total
BIPOC	37%	28%	35%	100%
White	14%	33%	53%	100%